

1 **City of Loveland**
2 **Community Marketing Commission**
3 **Special Meeting Summary**
4 **November 20, 2010**

5
6 A Special meeting of the Loveland Community Marketing Commission was held on Saturday, November 20,
7 2010 at 3:30 P.M. in the City Council Chambers of the Civic Center at 500 East Third Street, Loveland, CO.
8 Community Marketing Commissioners in attendance were: Rich Harter, Chair, Jeremy Elliott, Linda Hughey,
9 Rosemary Prawdzik, Ann Harroun, Judy Saffell and City Council Liaison, Carol Johnson. Also present were
10 staff liaison, Betsey Hale, Business Development, and Nikki Garshelis, Business Development/Development
11 Services.

12
13 **CALL TO ORDER**

14 *Commission Chairman Harter* called the meeting to order at 3:30p.m.

15
16 **RFP PRESENTATION REVIEW**

17 *The Commission* previously heard presentations from the final four Strategic Marketing/Branding firms,
18 JVA/Tenfold Collective, Lightsource, PUMA and Tool Box Creative. Community stakeholders were also present
19 for the presentations. Community Stakeholders had completed feedback forms and the Commissioners completed
20 evaluation forms during the presentations. Forms were tallied and the scores were submitted to the Commission.
21 Commission Chairman Harter asked for the Commissioner's feedback regarding the presentations.

22
23 *Commission Chair Harter* suggested since JVA had the lowest scores, discussion regarding their presentation be
24 eliminated. Lightsource, he stated, was very succinct, eloquent about marketing and very smart. He could not
25 speak to their creativity, he said. PUMA had good insight into the community, he said. In response to one of the
26 Commission's questions, Brad Segal said that there were no challenges, Commission Chair Harter said.
27 Commission Chair Harter said he was a bit worried that they already have the solution in their minds. Toolbox
28 is very dynamic and purposeful, Commission Chair Harter stated. They listened very well, he added. Their only
29 negative may be that they are too close, he said. He reported that Toolbox Creative was #1 with the CMC and #1
30 with the Stakeholders after all scores were considered.

31
32 *Commissioner Hughey* liked Lightsource but she noticed some of their limitations. They seemed very event
33 focused and less brand focused, she said. This is fine but Loveland has Engaging Loveland which is already
34 event focused, she said. They also seemed very Fort Collins-centric, she said. PUMA had an advantage due to
35 their previous work. However, they know the market and can drive people from Denver to the north, she said.
36 They may be too cookie cutter, she added. Toolbox understands how to get people to visit, she said. They have
37 the commitment, passion and energy to lead the process, she said. Their experience and knowledge was very
38 impressive, she concluded.

39
40 *Commissioner Prawdzik* said, after reading the materials she ranked Toolbox first but after the presentations, she
41 ranked Lightsource first. She liked their clear explanation of the objective, she said. They have a realistic view of
42 what needs to be accomplished, she added. Commission Chair Harter asked if she would be upset if Toolbox was
43 chosen over Lightsource and Commissioner Prawdzik said "no," she would not be upset at all. However,
44 Lightsource had the team she would like most to work with, she responded.

45
46 *Commissioner Prawdzik reported that Commissioner Dwyer*, who had to leave the meeting early, ranked Toolbox
47 first and Lightsource second.

48
49 *Commissioner Saffell* said she ranked Toolbox higher than Lightsource and PUMA but after the presentations
50 ranked Lightsource first. Lightsource has 15 years of success and would not have a problem separating Loveland
51 from Fort Collins, she stated. PUMA didn't allow the group to voice their opinions, she said.

1 *Commissioner Elliot* had concerns with Lightsource because, he believed, they didn't get the whole picture. They
2 were very focused on organization, he said. PUMA was focused on where they wanted to go and could do the
3 job, he said. Toolbox's research and perception was great, he added.

4
5 *Commissioner Harroun* said she ranked Lightsource after JVA. She ranked both Toolbox and Lightsource close,
6 she said.

7
8 *The Commission* discussed how to continue with the selection process. Betsey Hale assisted with the discussion
9 about comparing the bids. She also suggested that the Commission did not need to choose one final firm at the
10 meeting. The Commissioners agreed to:

- 11 • Ask Toolbox and Lightsource to return with more in-depth presentations.
- 12 • The Commissioners would create new questions for the two firms to focus on in their presentations.
- 13 • The Commissioners requested that Betsey check references of both firms.
- 14 • The Commissioners requested that Betsey ask Toolbox and Lightsource to prepare their bids with more
15 detail in order to compare apples to apples.
- 16 • The Commissioners requested that Betsey to notify PUMA and JVA on Tuesday, November 23rd that they
17 were not chosen.
- 18 • The Commission will meet on December 2nd to create the questions for the firm's new presentations and
19 discuss the upcoming grant cycles. Some stakeholders at the previous meeting indicated they would like
20 the CMC to concentrate on the Branding/Marketing Strategy and cancel the first grant cycle.
- 21 • The Commissioners requested that Betsey send an email to the previous meeting stakeholders and ask
22 them if they approve of canceling the upcoming grant cycle.
- 23
- 24

25 Adjourned 4:24p.m.